



WILDWOOD

MEMORANDUM

To: Mayor Bowlin and City Council Members

From: Rick C. Brown, Director of Public Works / City Engineer

Date: June 17, 2020

Re: Contractor Proposals for Removal, Treatment or Replacement of Ash Trees

The following recommendation (please see attached memorandum) was initially presented to the City Council at work session on April 13th, however, this item has been postponed two times. For the June 22nd work session, the recommendation is back on the agenda for your action.

Recommendation

The recommendation by the Department is to prepare legislation which would enable city-contractor agreements with the following tree contractors to address the demise of ash trees on City right of way:

Contractor	Proposed Work	2020 Anticipated Work
Timberline	Tree Removal, Stump Grinding, and Debris Removal	\$50,690.00
Arbor Masters	Ash Tree Treatment	\$24,222.50
Omni	Tree Planting	\$9,960.00 (This assumes the subsequent award of TRIM Grant by MDC)

For 2020, we have budgeted a total of \$75,000 in the Capital Projects Fund to address the impacts of EAB.

With approval of this recommendation by the City Council, the necessary enabling ordinance will be presented for the consideration of the City Council at the July 13th meeting.

Andy Berg, arborist with Davey Resource Group, and I will be available at the June 22nd work session of the City Council for any questions regarding this recommendation.

RCB



WILDWOOD

MEMORANDUM

To: Mayor Bowlin and City Council Members

From: Rick C. Brown, Director of Public Works / City Engineer

Date: April 8, 2020

Re: Contractor Proposals for Removal, Treatment or Replacement of Ash Trees

As you may be aware, ash trees located throughout the City of Wildwood are facing demise as the result of the Emerald Ash Borer. The Emerald Ash Borer (EAB) is an invasive beetle from Asia that was discovered in Detroit in 2002 and has since killed tens of millions of ash trees throughout 25 states in the Eastern United States and Canada. Research has shown that when a community is first infested with EAB, tree mortality is relatively low. However, as insect populations build, there is an exponential jump in mortality. This time frame can be anywhere from several years up to a decade. In Wildwood, we expect to see an increase in the mortality of ash trees over the next 3-5 years. Ultimately, the EAB will attack all ash species, regardless of their health. It is expected that within 10 years all urban ash trees will be dead.

To address the threat from the EAB, the Department engaged Davey Resource Group, Inc. (DRG) last year to complete an inventory of our existing ash street trees and to formulate a plan to manage the impacts of the EAB. The inventory indicated we have a total of 1,307 ash trees remaining on city right of way.

Analysis of the tree inventory data found the following:

- 23% are young trees (< 8 diameter inches)
- 56% are established (9-17 diameter inches)
- 20% are maturing (18-24 diameter inches)
- 2% are mature (> 24 diameter inches).
- Most of the trees (67%) were rated in fair condition while 20% were in good condition and 13% poor condition.

At previous meetings of the Admin/Public Works Committee, DRG provided four (4) approaches to addressing the remaining ash street trees as follows:

1. Do nothing
2. Remove and replace all ash trees
3. Treat all healthy and significant ash trees – viable chemical treatments are commercially available. These treatments, which are typically applied during May and June, require the tree to be treated on an every-other year basis in order to eliminate the EAB. Based on

DRG's field inventory, we have a total of 394 ash trees which would be good candidates to save by treatment.

4. Combination of treatments and phased removals

After discussion of these strategies by the Admin/PW Committee at their February 2020 meeting, the preference was to move forward with a strategy based on a combination of treatments, phased removals and replanting.

Therefore, in order to implement this strategy, the Department worked with DRG to prepare a RFP (request for proposal) which was provided to several area tree contractors. The RFP requested their costs for a three-phased program of tree removals, treatment and re-planting. On Friday, April 3, the Department received submittals from five (5) tree contractors, which has been included as **Exhibit A**.

Recommendation

Based on the pricing received in response to our RFP, the Department is recommending three (3) city-contractor agreements with the following tree contractors:

<u>Contractor</u>	<u>Proposed Work</u>
Timberline	Tree Removal, Stump Grinding, and Debris Removal
Arbor Masters	Ash Tree Treatment
Omni	Tree Planting

For 2020, we have budgeted a total of \$75,000 in the Capital Projects Fund to address the impacts of EAB. We are planning to keep all 2020 work within this budget as follows:

Treatment – for 2020, DRG is recommending the treatment of 199 of the 394 trees. (Trees will be treated every 2 years, so for 2021, we will treat the remaining 195 trees.) Based on the contractor pricing submitted by Arbor Masters, treatment of the proposed 199 trees will cost **\$24,222.50** for 2020.

Removals –We will focus on removal of trees in poor condition with sizes 1-18”. This will allow us to remove more trees with the allotted funds. For 2020, we propose to remove 190 trees. Based on the pricing submitted by Timberline, this work will cost **\$50,690**. Tree removal is expected to be required annually for several years and will require annual monitoring and inspection of remaining trees. The rate of removal may have to be adjusted annually in response to the actual rate of decline.

Re-Planting – Due to budget limitations, we did not budget to re-plant the 190 trees which are proposed for removal this year. We are hoping to replant next year, possibly by utilizing TRIM grants, as we've done in previous years. Re-planting, as with removals, will be required to continue for multiple years. As TRIM grants are limited, additional funds will need to be budgeted if we are to address this in future years. As Omni's tree planting pricing was the lowest (excepting two tree sizes), we are recommending an agreement with Omni for re-planting, when funds are available.

To summarize, the total cost of the proposed 2020 EAB work, which includes removal of 190 ash trees and treatment of 199 ash trees, is **\$74,912.50**.

With approval of this recommendation by the City Council, the Department will prepare the necessary enabling ordinance, authorizing the city-contractor agreements, for the consideration of the City Council at a later meeting.

I will be available at the April 13th work session of the City Council for any questions regarding this recommendation.

RCB

Exhibit A

Tree Removal, Stump Grinding, Debris Removal, and Seed & Straw Installation					
Size Class	Arbor Masters Cost per Tree	Davey Tree Cost Per Tree	Gamma Cost Per Tree	Omni Cost Per Tree	Timberline Cost Per Tree
1 - 3"	\$ 85.00	\$ 260.00	\$ 75.00	\$ 60.00	\$ 40.00
4 - 7"	\$ 145.00	\$ 310.00	\$ 175.00	\$ 80.00	\$ 55.00
8 - 12"	\$ 270.00	\$ 820.00	\$ 250.00	\$ 190.00	\$ 185.00
13 - 18"	\$ 400.00	\$ 1,560.00	\$ 525.00	\$ 540.00	\$ 460.00
19 - 24"	\$ 600.00	\$ 1,890.00	\$ 875.00	\$ 840.00	\$ 650.00
25 - 30"	\$ 725.00	\$ 2,140.00	\$ 1,250.00	\$ 1,100.00	\$ 1,045.00
31 - 36"	\$ 850.00	\$ 2,660.00	\$ 1,500.00	\$ 1,260.00	\$ 1,640.00
Ash Treatments					
Size Class	Arbor Masters Cost per Tree	Davey Tree Cost Per Tree	Gamma Cost Per Tree	Omni Cost Per Tree	Timberline Cost Per Tree
15"	\$ 97.50	\$ 120.00	\$ 125.00	\$ 124.00	\$ 105.00
16" - 18"	\$ 115.00	\$ 136.00	\$ 150.00	\$ 140.00	\$ 126.00
19" - 21"	\$ 130.00	\$ 160.00	\$ 185.00	\$ 165.00	\$ 147.00
22" - 24"	\$ 150.00	\$ 184.00	\$ 210.00	\$ 190.00	\$ 168.00
Tree Planting					
Plant Size	Arbor Masters Cost per Tree	Davey Tree Cost Per Tree	Gamma Cost Per Tree	Omni Cost Per Tree	Timberline Cost Per Tree
#7	\$ 345.00	\$ 283.00	\$ 175.00	\$ 90.00	\$ 150.00
#15	\$ 400.00	\$ 306.00	\$ 225.00	\$ 120.00	\$ 260.00
#25	\$ 525.00	\$ 469.00	\$ 250.00	\$ 210.00	\$ 300.00
1.5" BB	\$ 485.00	\$ 535.00	\$ 250.00	\$ 285.00	\$ 320.00
2" BB	\$ 600.00	\$ 613.00	\$ 350.00	\$ 340.00	\$ 366.00
2.5" BB	\$ 875.00	\$ 692.00	\$ 375.00	\$ 420.00	\$ 412.00
3" BB	\$ 975.00	\$ 770.00	\$ 450.00	\$ 540.00	\$ 504.00